

Narrative Bias in Urban Historiography A Critique of the Book the Story of Tehran



Farnoosh Makhles

Ph.D., Nazar Research Center for Art, Architecture and Urbanism, Iran.

Abstract

The book *The Story of Tehran* represents an attempt to present a narrative of the history and identity of Tehran, predicated upon two principal axes: the “natural criterion” and the “social criterion.” In this narrative, the formation and continuity of Tehran’s urban life are elucidated, on the one hand, by referencing the region’s ancient geological background and, on the other hand, by emphasizing the socio-cultural diversity of the city’s population. The fundamental question arises: has such an approach succeeded in providing a coherent, evidence-based depiction of Tehran’s urban history, or has it resulted in conceptual and methodological oversimplifications in its attempt to explicate the city?

This article aims to critically examine the theoretical foundations and the evidence employed in the narrative of *The Story of Tehran*. In this regard, the book’s two pivotal criteria—natural and social—are subjected to critical analysis. The findings of this critique indicate that the book’s natural narrative, by emphasizing the geological antiquity of the region, leads to a form of “naturalization” of urban history. Conversely, its social narrative, through the oversimplification of social structures and the circumvention of economic and institutional factors alongside urban policies, offers a reductionist explanation of Tehran’s social inequalities and transformations. Consequently, while both criteria utilized in the book are compelling at the level of storytelling, they confront significant conceptual limitations within the realm of scientific analysis. By critically evaluating the claims posited in the book, this article underscores the necessity of employing interdisciplinary approaches and evidence-based historical and social analyses, maintaining a rigorous scientific perspective in the study of Tehran’s urban history.

Keywords: Book critique, City of Tehran, *The Story of Tehran*, Seyyed Mohammad Beheshti.

Email: farnooshmakhles@gmail.com

Can the reduction of Tehran's complex urban history to natural myth-making and simplified social structures yield a scientific and systematic explanation of this metropolis's transformations? Or does it merely devolve into an unsubstantiated historical narrative?

Extended Abstract

The present study undertakes a critical and methodological evaluation of the book *The Story of Tehran* through the lens of urban historiography and sociology. The findings reveal that the aforementioned work, rather than presenting structured and scientific research, devolves into a descriptive and impressionistic narrative devoid of academic standards. The novelty of this critique lies in its rigorous dissection of the book's two central axes—the “natural criterion” and the “social criterion”—and the foregrounding of its fundamental shortcomings.

The key findings of this critical review are as follows: Historical Anachronism and Lack of Cohesion: The presence of analytical contradictions in evaluating specific historical periods, coupled with the invalid extrapolation of later demographic data to earlier epochs (e.g., the Qajar era), fundamentally destabilizes the text's theoretical framework.

Social Reductionism and Cultural Bias: The reductionist explanation of complex urban inequalities based solely on the “urban-origin/rural-origin” dichotomy, which entirely overlooks the foundational role of structural-institutional factors, economic policies, and the distribution of power in urban development.

Mythologizing the Natural Context: Metaphorically linking the city's history to macro-geological transformations without providing substantiated geomorphological analyses, thereby leading to a speculative exaggeration of nature's role.

Severe Deficiencies in Scientific Citation: A glaring lack of precise referencing, the presence of uncredited attributions from historical texts, and reliance on a highly restricted bibliography that completely ignores authoritative research in Tehranology from recent decades.

This study demonstrates that the book *The Story of Tehran*, owing to its profound conceptual weaknesses, analytical biases, and lack of empirical authenticity, lacks the requisite credibility for citation within academic and scientific communities. The urban historiography of Tehran necessitates the adoption of rigorous interdisciplinary approaches, the utilization of robust historical, geographical, and sociological data, and a conscious departure from reductionist and mythologizing explanations.

visual order risk eroding place identity and diminishing citizens' sense of belonging. Effective urban landscape interventions should prioritize contextual meaning, cultural specificity, and sensory richness rather than formal uniformity. Consequently, adopting theory informed evaluation frameworks and participatory design approaches is essential for achieving meaningful and sustainable urban beautification.

Amidst the extensive corpus of historical and urban research on Tehran, the book *The Story of Tehran* cannot be regarded as an authoritative source for the rigorous scientific analysis of the city's history. The examination of Tehran's history necessitates a systemic approach, founded upon the meticulous utilization of diverse historical and scientific sources, alongside theoretical analyses grounded in urban sociology. Only within such a methodological framework can a coherent, evidence-based narrative of Tehran's complex urban transformations be articulated—a narrative that neither falls into the trap of mythologizing the city's natural past nor reduces its social intricacies to speculative and reductionist explanations.

COPYRIGHTS

Copyright for this article is retained by the authors with publication rights granted to Journal of Critical Reviews (JCR); The Iranian Journal of Critical Studies in Place. This is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<https://creativecommons.org/version4/>)

